1	Repetitive emissions of rising-tone chorus waves in the inner
2	magnetosphere
3	Quanming Lu <sup>1,2*</sup> , Lunjin Chen <sup>3+</sup> , Xueyi Wang <sup>4</sup> , Xinliang Gao <sup>1,2</sup> , Yu Lin <sup>4</sup> , and Shui
4	Wang <sup>1,2</sup>
5	<sup>1</sup> CAS Key Laboratory of Geospace Environment, Department of Geophysics and
6	Planetary Science, University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei 230026,
7	China
8	<sup>2</sup> CAS Center for Excellence in Comparative Planetology, China
9	<sup>3</sup> Department of Physics, University of Texas at Dallas, Richardson, Texas, USA
10	<sup>4</sup> Physics Department, Auburn University, Auburn, Alabama, USA
11	*Email: qmlu@ustc.edu.cn
12	<sup>+</sup> Email:lunjin.chen@gmail.com
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	

### 19 Key points:

We develop a 1D PIC-δf simulation embedding a continuous injection of
 energetic electrons in a dipole magnetic field

22 2. It is demonstrated that a continuous injection of energetic electrons is essential23 for the repetitive emissions of chorus waves.

3. An intense injection of energetic electrons will lead to a decrease of the timeseparation between the chorus elements

26

# Abstract

Chorus waves in the inner magnetospheres of the Earth and other magnetized 27 planets typically occur in the form of discrete and repetitive quasi-monochromatic 28 29 emissions with a frequency chirping, which was discovered more than 50 years ago. However, until now there is still no satisfactory explanations for repetitive emissions 30 of chorus waves. In this Letter, chorus emissions excited by energetic electrons with a 31 temperature anisotropy are studied by a one-dimensional PIC- $\delta f$  simulation in a 32 dipole magnetic field, and it is demonstrated that a continuous injection of energetic 33 electrons caused by an azimuthal drift is essential for the repetitive emissions of 34 chorus waves. Consistent with satellite observations, both discrete and continuous 35 spectra can be reproduced. An intense injection of energetic electrons will lead to a 36 decrease of the time separation between the chorus elements, and the chorus 37 38 emissions evolve from a discrete to a continuous spectrum when the injection is sufficiently strong. 39

40 Plain Language Summary

41 Chorus waves are electromagnetic emissions that are commonly observed in the 42 Earth's inner magnetospheres, and they typically occur in the form of discrete and 43 repetitive quasi-monochromatic emissions with a rising frequency chirping. The rising 44 frequency chirping of chorus waves are considered to be related with electromagnetic 45 electron hole in the wave phase space formed after resonant electrons have been

trapped by whistler-mode waves. However, until now there is still no satisfactory 46 explanations for repetitive emissions of chorus waves. We develop a one-dimensional 47 PIC- $\delta f$  simulation model to study the excitation of chorus waves by energetic 48 electrons with a temperature anisotropy in a dipole magnetic field, and a continuous 49 injection of energetic electrons is embedded in the model. The repetitive emissions of 50 chorus waves with a rising frequency chirping are generated in the simulations, and it 51 52 is demonstrated clearly that the continuous injection of energetic electrons caused by an azimuthal drift is the reason for the repetitive emissions of chorus waves. It is 53 further found that an intense injection of energetic electrons will lead to a decrease of 54 the time separation between the chorus elements, and a continuous spectrum is 55 formed when the injection is sufficiently strong. 56

57

## 58 **1. Introduction**

59 Chorus waves are electromagnetic emissions that are commonly observed in 60 geospace consisting of ionized gas (plasma) embedded with a magnetic field, and known for an ensemble of distinct elements with each showing frequency chirping 61 (Butis and Helliwell, 1969; Tsurutani and Smith, 1974, 1977; Meredith et al., 2001; Li 62 et al., 2012). Such frequency chirping in every element is often featured with a rising 63 frequency (over ~1 kHz) over a short duration of period (~ 0.1 seconds). Chorus 64 waves are so named to reflect similar frequency-time variation to birds' dawn chorus 65 in acoustic mode. Such electromagnetic chorus waves have well-known for their 66 significant roles in geospace phenomena, to name a few, acceleration of electrons to 67 relativistic energy and thus the formation of Earth's radiation belts (Summers et al., 68 1998; Horne et al., 2005; Xiao et al., 2009; Thorne et al., 2013); precipitation of 69 electrons into the ionosphere, and thus generation of diffuse and pulsating aurora 70 (Lorentzen et al., 2001; Thorne et al., 2005, 2010; Ni et al., 2008; Lam et al., 2010). 71 72 The exhibition of a series of short-living microburst often seen in electron precipitation is generally considered to be caused by the repetitive emissions of 73 chorus elements (Hikishima et al., 2010; Mozer et al., 2018; Tsurutani et al., 2013). 74

Rising-tone chorus waves have been successfully reproduced in particle-in-cell 75 (PIC) and Vlasov simulations, and their formation is considered to be fulfilled 76 through nonlinear wave-particle interaction (Nunn et al., 1997, 2012; Katoh and 77 Omura, 2006; Omura et al., 2009, 2011; Hikishima and Omura, 2012; Tao et al., 2014; 78 Ke et al., 2017; Lu et al., 2019). An electromagnetic electron hole in the wave phase 79 space is formed after resonant electrons have been trapped by whistler-mode waves, 80 and then a resonant current is generated when the background magnetic field has a 81 spatial inhomogeneity, which at last results in rising-tone chorus waves (Omura and 82 Summers, 2006; Omura et al., 2009; Hikishima and Omura, 2012). However, these 83 84 PIC simulations were performed in an isolated system, where electrons are forced to be bounded along a single field line. Such an isolated system is not realistic because 85 in reality the electrons are subject to azimuthal drift across the field line where chorus 86

87 elements are excited. For these simulations, only one or several distinct elements of rising-tone chorus have been observed since the free energy stored in the electron 88 distribution is released in a bursty way, and the repetitive feature as typically shown 89 in satellite observations cannot be reproduced (Ke et al., 2017). In this Letter, with a 90 one-dimensional (1-D) PIC- $\delta f$  simulation, in which a continuous injection of 91 energetic electrons with a temperature anisotropy caused by the azimuthal drift is 92 implemented, we demonstrate the generation mechanism of repetitive emissions of 93 94 rising-tone chorus waves.

# 95 2. Simulation Setup

A one-dimensional (1-D) PIC- $\delta f$  simulation model is developed to study the 96 emissions of rising-tone chorus waves in a dipole magnetic field. In the simulations, 97 98 there are two electron components: cold and energetic electrons. We split the electron distribution into a background and perturbed parts  $f = f_0 + \delta f$ , and obtain the 99 evolution of the perturbed electron distribution  $\delta f$  (Sydora, 2003; Tao et al., 2017). 100 In our model, as schematically shown in Figure 1, a continuous injection of energetic 101 electrons caused by an azimuthal drift in a dipole magnetic field is considered. Due to 102 the azimuthal drift, energetic electrons with a distribution  $f_0$  are injected into the 103 simulation domain, and energetic electrons leaving the simulation domain have a 104 distribution f. The time scale related to the injection of energetic electrons can be 105 estimated as the ratio of transverse scale of individual chorus element and electron 106 drift speed. 107

Initially, the distribution of energetic electrons is assumed to satisfy the bi-Maxwellian function at the equator as follows: the ratio of the number density of energetic electrons to that of cold electrons is  $n_{h0}/n_{c0} = 0.6\%$ , the ratio of cold electron plasma frequency to electron gyrofrequency is  $\omega_{pe}/\Omega_{e0} = 4.97$  (where

 $\omega_{pe} = \sqrt{n_0 e^2 / m_e \varepsilon_0}$  is the electron plasma frequency,  $n_0 = n_{c0} + n_{h0}$ , 112 and  $\Omega_{e0} = eB_{0eq} / m_e$  is the electron gyrofrequency at the equator), the temperature 113 anisotropy of energetic electrons is  $T_{\perp 0}/T_{\parallel 0} = 6$ , and the parallel plasma beta of 114 energetic electrons is  $\beta_{\parallel h0} = n_{h0}T_{\parallel 0} / (B_{0eq}^2 / 2\mu_0) = 0.01$ . These parameters are typical 115 values at L=6, and the other values of these parameters off the equator along the 116 magnetic field can be obtained with the Liouville's theorem (Lu et al., 2019). In the 117 simulations, there are 4000 grid number, and grid cell is  $0.34d_e$  (where  $d_e = c/\omega_{pe}$ 118 is the electron inertial length). The topology of the magnetic field in the simulations is 119 roughly equal to that at L=0.6, and the latitude ranges from about  $-32^{0}$  to  $32^{0}$ . On 120 average, there are about 4000 particles per cell, and the time step is  $0.03 \,\Omega_{e0}^{-1}$ . 121 Absorbing boundary condition is applied for the electromagnetic field, while 122 reflecting boundary is applied for particles. Different from the previous PIC 123 simulations performed in an isolated system (Ke et al., 2017), energetic electrons with 124 a temperature anisotropy are injected continuously into the simulation domain due to 125 the azimuthal drift, which is determined by a time scale  $\tau_D$ . The details of the model 126 and simulation setup can be found in the supplementary information. 127

128

#### **3.** Simulation Results

As described in previous PIC simulations without a continuous injection of 129 130 energetic electrons, whistler mode waves are excited by the electron temperature anisotropy around the magnetic equator, and they have frequency chirping with a 131 rising tone after leaving the source region with a limited altitude about  $3^0$  (Lu et al., 132 2019). Figure 2 plots the spectrogram of wave magnetic power at the latitude  $\lambda = 15^{\circ}$ , 133 which is obtained from the 1-D PIC- $\delta f$  simulations. At this latitude, the rising-tone 134 chorus waves are clearly shown. For the case of  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = \infty$ , where energetic electron 135 injection into the system is turned off, only one rising-tone element forms(Figure 2a). 136 This case is similar to that of an isolated system, which has been studied by many 137

previous particle-in-cell (PIC) simulations (Hikishima and Omura, 2012; Tao et al., 138 2014; Ke et al., 2017; Lu et al., 2019). In such a situation, the free energy is provided 139 by the initial anisotropic distribution of energetic electrons, and in general only one 140 element of chorus waves is generated. When energetic electrons are injected 141 continuously into the system, the chorus waves exhibit repetitive elements with a 142 rising frequency. With the intensification of the energetic electron injection (through 143 the decrease of  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D$ ), the time separation between the elements become smaller 144 and smaller. At  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = 2000$ , the chorus waves display an ensemble of discrete and 145 repetitive elements as shown in Figure 2b. The average time separation between the 146 elements is about  $1000 \Omega_{e0}^{-1}$ . If we use the magnetic field at L=6, the time separation is 147 estimated to be around 0.05s. When the injection of energetic electrons is sufficiently 148 149 intense, the time separation between the elements is even smaller and spectrogram looks like an almost continuous spectrum (Figure 2c). The frequencies of these waves 150 range from ~0.2  $\Omega_{e0}$  to ~0.75  $\Omega_{e0}$ , and the amplitudes of the chorus waves are 151  $B_w/B_0 \sim 2 \times 10^{-3}$ . Assuming L=6, we can know that the amplitude is about 300pT. 152

It is generally accepted that chorus waves are excited as a result of electron holes 153 in the wave-particle interaction angle ( $\zeta$ ), which are formed by electrons resonantly 154 trapped in the waves. Similarly, we can also find such kind of electron holes in our 155 PIC- $\delta f$  simulations. A typical electron hole at  $\Omega_{e0}t = 6700$  for the case with 156  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = 2000$  is shown in Figure 3a by plotting the electron distributions  $\delta f(v_{\parallel},\zeta)$  at 157 different values of  $v_{\perp} \,/\, V_{\parallel te}$  (where  $\zeta$  is the angle made by electron perpendicular 158 velocity and wave perpendicular magnetic field vector, and  $V_{\parallel te}$  is the thermal 159 velocity of energetic electrons). The hole only exists in the range  $v_{\perp}/V_{\parallel te}$  from ~0.5 160 to ~6.5 (Figure 3a). By comparing Figure 2a and Figure 3b-d, we can find that each 161 chorus element is accompanied by an electron hole and their duration in time are 162 comparable. 163

In our 1-D PIC- $\delta f$  simulations that target the repetitive nature of chorus waves, the wave emissions are propagating along the magnetic field. A wave power gap at half electron gyrofrequency, which is often observed in the magnetosphere, is not reproduced, and the lack of the gap in the 1D simulation implies that such a gap may be caused by Landau damping as a consequence of oblique propagation.

### 169 **4. Discussion**

Whistler-mode waves are at first excited by the electron temperature anisotropy 170 in a localized region around the equator, a rising tone emission of chorus waves is 171 then generated when the amplitude of the whistler mode waves satisfies a threshold 172 173 condition. As pointed out in Omura et al. (2009), the amplitude of chorus waves is determined by the nonlinear growth of the chorus waves and wave attenuation caused 174 by the convection effect due to the inhomogeneity along the magnetic field line, and 175 the nonlinear growth of the chorus waves is related to the resonant electron 176 177 distribution.

If there is no refilling of energetic electrons to replenish the initial electron 178 distribution, with the frequency increase of the chorus emissions, less and less 179 electrons can resonantly interact with the chorus waves, and the amplitude of the 180 chorus waves becomes smaller and smaller until the cease of the chorus elements. In 181 such a situation, because the available free energy provided by the electron 182 temperature anisotropy is limited, there is only chorus element as described in the 183 case with  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = \infty$ . When anisotropic electrons are injected continuously into the 184 185 system, another cycle of chorus element formation will start after the free energy provided by the refilled electron distribution become sufficiently large, and this 186 process can repeat again and again. At last, the repetitive emissions of chorus waves 187 188 are generated.

189 With the intensification of the electron injection (decreasing  $\tau_D$ ), the time delay 190 to provide the sufficient free energy to generate the next cycle of chorus element become small, therefore, the time separation between the chorus elements decreaseuntil a continuous spectrum is formed.

In the previous PIC and Vlasov simulations of chorus waves in a dipole field, the 193 electrons leaving from the boundaries are assumed to be reflected into the simulation 194 system (Katoh et al., 2007; Nunn et al., 1997). In these simulations, several chorus 195 elements may be generated because the supplied electron fluxes from the boundaries 196 still have free energy to excited whistler-mode waves. However, the free energy will 197 be exhausted after several times of the reflection in the boundaries, and then the 198 generation of chorus waves stops. In our simulations, the refill electron fluxes are 199 caused by an azimuthal drift, and their distribution is kept as the initial one. Therefore, 200 201 the repetitive emissions of chorus waves are generated because there is always free energy to excite whistler-mode waves. 202

# 203 **5. Conclusions**

In this Letter, we developed a 1-D PIC- $\delta f$  simulation model to study chorus 204 emissions in a dipole magnetic field, where the injection of anisotropic energetic 205 electrons is considered. The injection of energetic electrons through the azimuthal 206 drift into the field line of chorus excitation is found to play a critical role to generate 207 the repetitive emissions of rising-tone chorus waves. When the injection is considered, 208 the chorus waves exhibit an ensemble of discrete and repetitive elements, and each 209 element is accompanied by an electromagnetic electron holes in the wave-particle 210 interaction phase space. The time separation between the elements shortens with the 211 intensification of the injection, which is consistent with satellite observations (Gao et 212 al., 2014). 213

Discrete and repetitive emissions of chorus waves are ubiquitously observed in the earth's radiation belt, and our PIC- $\delta f$  simulation models show that such kind of repetitive emissions is mediated by the injection of energetic electrons caused by the azimuthal drift in the dipole field. Chorus waves are also observed as a hiss-like emission with an apparently continuous spectrum (Gao et al., 2014). Such continuous
spectrum can also be accounted for by the effect of electron injection. When the
injection is sufficiently strong, the time separation between elements becomes small
in comparison with individual element duration. As a result, the elements will overlap
each other and chorus waves of a continuous spectrum form.

## 223 Acknowledgements:

This work was supported by the NSFC grant 41774169, and Key Research Program

of Frontier Sciences, CAS(QYZDJ-SSW-DQC010).

## 226 Data Availability Statement

227 Simulation datasets for this research are available at the following link
228 https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.14480823.

## 229 **References**

- Burtis, W. J., and R. A. Helliwell(1969), Banded chorus—A new type of VLF
  radiation observed in the magnetosphere by OGO 1 and OGO 3, J. Geophys.
  Res., 74(11), 3002–3010, doi:10.1029/JA074i011p03002.
- Gao, X. L., W. Li, R. M. Thorne, J. Bortnik, V. Angelopoulos, Q. M. Lu, X. Tao, and
  S. Wang(2014), New evidence for generation mechanisms of discrete and
  hiss-like whistler mode waves, Geophys. Res. Lett., 41, 4905-4811.
- Hikishima, M., Y. Omura, and D. Summers(2010), Microburst precipitation of
  energetic electrons associated with chorus wave generation, Geophys. Res. Lett.,
  37, L07103, doi:10.1029/2010GL042678.
- Hikishima, M., and Y. Omura (2012), Particle simulations of whistler-mode
  rising-tone emissions triggered by waves with different amplitudes, J. Geophys.
  Res., 117, A04226, doi:10.1029/2011JA017428.
- Horne, R. B., R.M. Thorne, S. A. Glauert, J. M. Albert, N. P. Meredith, and R. R.
  Anderson (2005), Timescale for radiation belt electron acceleration by whistler

- 244 mode chorus waves, J. Geophys. Res., 110, A03225,
  245 doi:10.1029/2004JA010811.
- Katoh, Y., and Y. Omura (2006), A study of generation mechanism of VLF triggered
  emission by self-consistent particle code, J. Geophys. Res., 111, A12207,
  doi:10.1029/2006JA011704.
- Katoh, Y., and Y. Omura (2007), Computer simulation of chorus wave generation in
  the Earth's inner magnetosphere, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, L03102,
  doi:10.1029/2006GL028594.
- Ke Y., X. Gao, Q. Lu, X. Wang, and S. Wang (2017), Generation of risingtone chorus
  in a two-dimensional mirror field by using the general curvilinear PIC code, J.
  Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 122, 8154–8165, doi:10.1002/2017JA024178.
- Lam, M. M., R. B. Horne, N. P. Meredith, S. A. Glauert, T. Moffat-Griffin, and J. C.
  Green (2010), Origin of energetic electron precipitation >30 keV into the
  atmosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 115, A00F08, doi:10.1029/2009JA014619.
- Li, W., R. M. Thorne, J. Bortnik, X. Tao, and V. Angelopoulos(2012), Characteristics
  of hiss-like and discrete whistler mode emissions, Geophys. Res. Lett., 39,
  L18106, doi:10.1029/2012GL053206.
- Lorentzen, K. R., J. B. Blake, U. S. Inan, and J. Bortnik (2001), Observations of
  relativistic electron microbursts in association with VLF chorus, J. Geophys.
  Res., 106(A4), 6017–6027, doi:10.1029/2000JA003018.
- Lu, Q., Ke, Y., Wang, X., Liu, K., Gao, X., Chen, L., and Wang, S. (2019). Twodimensional general curvilinear particle-in-cell (gcPIC) simulation of rising-tone
  chorus waves in a dipole magnetic field. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space
  Physics, 124, 4157–4167. https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JA026586.
- Meredith, N. P., R. B. Horne, and R. R. Anderson(2001), Substorm dependence of
  chorus amplitudes: Implications for the acceleration of electrons to relativistic
  energies, J. Geophys. Res., 106(A7), 13,165–13,178,

#### doi:10.1029/2000JA900156.

- Mozer, F. S., O. V. Agapitov, J. B. Blake, and I. Y. Vasko (2018), Simultaneous
  observations of lower band chorus emissions at the equator and microburst
  precipitating electrons in the ionosphere, Geophys. Res. Lett., 45, 511-516,
  doi:10.1002/2017GL076120.
- Ni, B., R. M. Thorne, Y. Y. Shprits, and J. Bortnik(2008), Resonant scattering of
  plasma sheet electrons by whistler-mode chorus: Contribution to diffuse auroral
  precipitation, Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L11106, doi:10.1029/2008GL034032.
- Nunn, D., Y. Omura, H. Matsumoto, I. Nagano, and S. Yagitani (1997), The
  numerical simulation of VLF chorus and discrete emissions observed on the
  Geotail satellite, J. Geophys. Res, 102(A12), 27083-27097.
- Nunn, D., and Y. Omura (2012), A computational and theoretical analysis of falling
  frequency VLF emissions J. Geophys. Res. 117, A08228, doi:10.1029/
  2012JA017557.
- Omura, Y., and D. Summers(2006), Dynamics of high-energy electrons interacting
  with whistler mode chorus emissions in the magnetosphere, J. Geophys. Res.,
  111, A09222, doi:10.1029/2006JA011600.
- Omura, Y., M. Hikishima, Y. Katoh, D. Summers, and S. Yagitani(2009), Nonlinear
  mechanisms of lower-band and upper-band VLF chorus emissions in the
  magnetosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 114, A07217, doi:10.1029/2009JA014206.
- Omura, Y., and D. Nunn (2011), Triggering process of whistler mode chorus
  emissions in the magnetosphere J. Geophys. Res. 116, A05205,
  doi:10.1029/2010JA016280.
- Summers, D., R. M. Thorne, and F. L. Xiao (1998), Relativistic theory of
  wave-particle resonant diffusion with application to electron acceleration in the
  magnetosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 103(A9), 20,487–20,500,
  doi:10.1029/98JA01740.

12

- Sydora, R. D. (2003), Low noise electrostatic and electromagnetic δ*f*particle-in-cell simulation of plasmas, Space Plasma Simulation, J. Buchner, C.T.
  Dum, M. Scholer (Eds.): LNP 615, pp. 109–124.
- Tao, X. (2014), A numerical study of chorus generation and the related variation of
  wave intensity using the DAWN code, J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 119,
  3362–3372, doi:10.1002/2014JA019820.
- Tao, X., F. Zonca, and L. Chen(2017), Investigations of the electron phase space dynamics in triggered whistler wave emissions using low noise  $\delta f$  method, Plasma Phys. Control. Fusion, 59, 094001, doi:10.1088/1361-6587/aa759a.
- Thorne, R. M., T. P. O'Brien, Y. Y. Shprits, D. Summers, and R. B. Horne (2005),
  Timescale for MeV electron microburst loss during geomagnetic storms, J.
  Geophys. Res., 110, A09202, doi:10.1029/2004JA010882.
- Thorne, R. M., B. Ni, X. Tao, R. B. Horne, and N. P. Meredith(2010), Scattering by
  chorus wave as the dominant cause of diffuse auroral precipitation, Nature, 467,
  934-936, doi:10.1038/nature09467.
- Thorne, R. M., et al., (2013) Rapid local acceleration of relativistic radiation-belt
  electrons by magnetospheric chorus, Nature, 504(7480), 411,
  doi:10.1038/Nature12889.
- Tsurutani, B. T., and E. J. Smith (1974), Postmidnight chorus: A substorm
  phenomenon, J. Geophys. Res., 79(1), 118–127, doi:10.1029/JA079i001p00118.
- Tsurutani, B. T., and E. J. Smith(1977), Two types of magnetospheric ELF chorus and
  their substorm dependences, J. Geophys. Res., 82(32), 5112–5128,
  doi:10.1029/JA082i032p05112.
- Tsurutani, B. T., G. S. Lakhina, and O. P. Verkhoglyadova (2013), Energetic electron
  (>10 keV) microburst precipitation, 5–15 s X-ray pulsations, chorus, and
  wave-particle interactions: A review, J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 118,

doi:10.1002/jgra.50264.

Xiao, F. L., Z. P. Su, H. N. Zheng, and S. Wang(2009), Modeling of outer radiation
belt electron by multidimensional diffusion process, J. Geophys. Res., 114,
A03201, doi:10.1029/2008JA013580.

328 Figure Captions

Figure 1 The schmetic diagram for the evolution of energetic electrons in a dipole magnetic field. Due to an azimuthal drift, energetic electrons with a distribution  $f_0$ is injected into the simulation domain, while particles leaving the domain have a distribution f. The blue-shaded region is the region of chorus wave excitation.

Figure 2 The spectrogram of magnetic power for chorus waves obtained at the 333 latitude  $\lambda = 15^{\circ}$  from the PIC- $\delta f$  simulations. a  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = \infty$ . b  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = 2000$ . 334 c  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D = 400$ . Here, the dotted and dashed lines in black or white represent  $0.1 \Omega_{e0}$ 335 and  $0.5 \Omega_{e0}$ , respectively, and  $\Omega_{e0} (= 2\pi f_{ce})$  is the electron gyrofrequency at the 336 equator. The frequencies of these waves range from ~0.2  $\Omega_{e0}$  to ~0.75  $\Omega_{e0}$ . 337 Figure 3 Electron holes associated with chorus waves obtained at the latitude 338  $\lambda = 15^{\circ}$  from the  $\delta f$  simulations. a Electron distributions  $\delta f(v_{\parallel}, v_{\perp}, \zeta)$  at 339 different values of  $v_{\perp}/V_{\parallel te}$  for the selected hole at  $\Omega_{e0}t = 6700$  for the case with 340  $\Omega_{e0}\tau_D$ =2000. b-d The time evolution of electron distributions  $\delta f(v_{\parallel})$  at  $\zeta$ =0.8 $\pi$ 341

and  $v_{\perp} / V_{\parallel te} = 2.25$  for the three cases,  $\Omega_{e0} \tau_D = \infty$ , 2000, and 400, respectively.

Figure 1.



Figure 2.



Figure 3.

